

Draft: April 7, 2008

*New model law on medical professional liability closed claim reporting*

## **MEDICAL PROFESSIONAL LIABILITY CLOSED CLAIM REPORTING MODEL LAW**

### **Table of Contents**

Section 1.	Statement of Purpose
Section 2.	Definitions
Section 3.	Applicability and Scope
Section 4.	Reporting Requirements
Section 5.	Required Data Elements
Section 6.	Confidentiality of Data
Section 7.	Authority to Adopt Rules
Section 8.	Effective Date

**Drafting Introductory Note:** This model law pertains to the collection of data necessary to accomplish the purpose stated in Section 1. It is not intended to discourage states from collecting additional data for other purposes.

### **Section 1. Statement of Purpose**

This Act is intended to ensure the availability of closed claim data necessary for thorough analysis and understanding of issues associated with medical professional liability claims, in order to support the establishment and maintenance of sound public policy.

### **Section 2. Definitions**

As used in this Act:

- A. "Claim" means:
  - (1) A demand for monetary damages for injury or death caused by medical malpractice; or
  - (2) A voluntary indemnity payment for injury or death caused by medical malpractice.
- B. "Claimant" means a person, including a decedent's estate, who is seeking or has sought monetary damages for injury or death caused by medical malpractice.
- C. "Closed claim" means a claim that has been settled or otherwise disposed of by the insuring entity, self-insurer, facility or provider. A claim may be closed with or without an indemnity payment to a claimant.
- D. "Commissioner" means the commissioner of insurance.
- E. "Companion claims" means separate claims involving the same incident of medical malpractice made against other providers or facilities.
- F. "Economic damages" means objectively verifiable monetary losses, including medical expenses, loss of earnings, burial costs, loss of use of property, cost of replacement or repair, cost of obtaining substitute domestic services and loss of business or employment opportunities.
- G. "Health care facility" or "facility" means a clinic, diagnostic center, hospital, laboratory, mental health center, nursing home, office, surgical facility, treatment facility or similar place where a health care provider provides health care to patients.

- H. “Health care provider” or “provider” means:
- (1) A person licensed to provide health care or related services, including an acupuncturist, doctor of medicine or osteopathy, a dentist, a nurse, an optometrist, a podiatric physician and surgeon, a chiropractor, a physical therapist, a psychologist, a pharmacist, an optician, a physician’s assistant, a midwife, an osteopathic physician’s assistant, a nurse practitioner or a physician’s trained mobile intensive care paramedic. If the person is deceased, this includes his or her estate or personal representative; or
  - (2) An employee or agent of a person described in paragraph (1) of this subsection, acting in the course and scope of his or her employment. If the employee or agent is deceased, this includes his or her estate or personal representative.
- I. “Insuring entity” means:
- (1) An authorized insurer;
  - (2) A captive insurer;
  - (3) A joint underwriting association;
  - (4) A patient compensation fund;
  - (5) A risk retention group; or
  - (6) An unauthorized insurer that provides surplus lines coverage.
- J. “Medical malpractice” means an actual or alleged negligent act, error, or omission in providing or failing to provide health care services.
- K. vff Insurance C

- (1) Every insuring entity or self-insurer that provides medical professional liability insurance to any facility or provider in this State must report each medical professional liability closed claim to the commissioner.
  - (2) A closed claim that is covered under a primary policy and one or more excess policies shall be reported only by the insuring entity that issued the primary policy. The insuring entity that issued the primary policy shall report the total amount, if any, paid with respect to the closed claim, including any amount paid under an excess policy, any amount paid by the facility or provider, and any amount paid by any other person on behalf of the facility or provider.
  - (3) If a claim is not covered by an insuring entity or self-insurer, the facility or provider named in the claim must report it to the commissioner after a final claim disposition has occurred due to a court proceeding or a settlement by the parties. Instances in which a claim may not be covered by an insuring entity or self-insurer include situations in which:
    - (a) The facility or provider did not buy insurance or maintained a self-insured retention that was larger than the final judgment or settlement;
    - (b) The claim was denied by an insuring entity or self-insurer because it did not fall within the scope of the insurance coverage agreement; or
    - (c) The annual aggregate coverage limits had been exhausted by other claim payments.
  - (4)
    - (a) If a court of competent jurisdiction determines that any self-insurer, risk retention group or unauthorized insurer is exempt from this Act due to a federal preemption or other cause, the facility or provider named in a medical professional liability claim must report all data required by this Act.
    - (b) In the absence of a ruling from a court of competent jurisdiction, if any self-insurer, risk retention group or unauthorized insurer fails to report information required by this Act or asserts a federal exemption or other jurisdictional preemption, the commissioner may, at his or her sole discretion, grant a waiver from the reporting requirements of this Act.
    - (c) In the event that a waiver is granted under subsection A(4)(b) of this section, the facility or provider named in a medical professional liability claim must report all data required by this Act on behalf of the self-insurer, risk retention group or unauthorized insurer.
- B. Beginning in [insert year], reports required under subsection A of this section must be filed by March 1. These reports must include data for all claims closed in the preceding calendar year and any adjustments to data reported in prior years.
- C. The commissioner may adopt rules that require insuring entities, self-insurers, facilities and providers to submit all required closed claim data electronically.

**Drafting Note:** Many State insurance codes specify penalties for failure to timely file statutorily required reports or for submitting materially incorrect data. Each State should determine the applicability of such penalties to this Act. If it is determined that the State does not possess an adequate means to enforce this Act, the State may wish to consider amending the Act to provide for such penalties.

DraftTc0 Tw

coding protocol shall be consistent with the format and coding protocol for data reported to the National Practitioner Data Bank.

- A. Claim and incident identifiers, including:
  - (1) A claim identifier assigned to the claim by the insuring entity, self-insurer, facility or provider; and
  - (2) An incident identifier if companion claims have been made by a claimant;
- B. The policy limits of the medical professional liability insurance policy covering the claim;
- C. The medical specialty of the provider who was primarily responsible for the medical malpractice incident that led to the claim;
- D. The type of health care facility where the medical malpractice incident occurred;
- E. The primary location within a facility where the medical malpractice incident occurred;
- F. The geographic location, by city and county, where the medical malpractice incident occurred;
- G. The injured person's sex and age on the incident date;
- H. The severity of malpractice injury using the National Practitioner Data Bank severity scale;
- I. The dates of:
  - (1) The earliest act or omission by the defendant that was the proximate cause of the claim;
  - (2) Notice to the insuring entity, self-insurer, facility or provider;
  - (3) Suit, if a suit was filed;
  - (4) Final indemnity payment, if any; and
  - (5) Final action by the insuring entity, self-insurer, facility or provider to close the claim;
- J. Settlement information that identifies the timing and final method of claim disposition, including:
  - (1) Claims settled by the parties;
  - (2) Claims disposed of by a court, including the date disposed;
  - (3) Claims disposed of by alternative dispute resolution, such as arbitration, mediation, private trial and other common dispute resolution methods; and
  - (4) Whether the settlement occurred before or after trial, if a trial occurred;
- K. Specific information about the indemnity payments and defense and cost containment expenses, including:
  - (1) For claims disposed of by a court that result in a verdict or judgment that itemizes damages:
    - (a) The indemnity payment made on behalf of the defendant;
    - (b) Economic damages;

- (c) Noneconomic damages;
  - (d) Punitive damages, if applicable; and
  - (e) Defense and cost containment expenses, including court costs, attorneys' fees, and costs of expert witnesses; and
- (2) For claims that do not result in a verdict or judgment that itemizes damages:
- (a) The total amount of the settlement on behalf of the defendant;
  - (b) The insuring entity's or self-insurer's best estimate of economic damages included in the settlement;
  - (c) The insuring entity's or self-insurer's best estimate of noneconomic damages included in the settlement; and
  - (d) Defense and cost containment expenses, including court costs, attorneys' fees, and costs of expert witnesses;
- L. The reason for the medical professional liability claim. The reporting entity must use the same allegation group and specific allegation codes that are used for mandatory reporting to the National Practitioner Data Bank; and
- M. Any other closed claim data the commissioner determines to be necessary to accomplish the purpose of this Act and requires by adopting a rule.

## **Section 6. Confidentiality of Data**

**Drafting Note:** Each state should determine the extent to which the data collected may be made available to other parties and insert wording consistent with that determination. Options include:

- All data are available to the public.
- All data are subject to release under certain restricted conditions, such as to applicants submitting a research proposal and signing a confidentiality agreement.
-

This Act shall take effect on [insert date].

W:\Drafts\Model Laws, Regulations & Guidelines\Adopted\077\New - Medical Malpractice Closed Claim Reporting Model Law\Med Prof Liab closed claim reporting law April 7 08.doc